

Minutes of the Meeting of the Council of the City of Sheffield held in the Council Chamber, Town Hall, Pinstone Street, Sheffield, S1 2HH, on Wednesday 3 January 2018, at 5.00 pm, pursuant to notice duly given and Summonses duly served.

**PRESENT**

THE LORD MAYOR (Councillor Anne Murphy)  
THE DEPUTY LORD MAYOR (Councillor Magid Magid)

1	<i>Beauchief &amp; Greenhill Ward</i> Andy Nash Bob Pullin Richard Shaw	10	<i>East Ecclesfield Ward</i> Pauline Andrews Steve Wilson	19	<i>Nether Edge &amp; Sharrow Ward</i> Mohammad Maroof Jim Steinke Alison Teal
2	<i>Beighton Ward</i> Chris Rosling-Josephs Ian Saunders Sophie Wilson	11	<i>Ecclesall Ward</i> Roger Davison Shaffaq Mohammed Paul Scriven	20	<i>Park &amp; Arbourthorne</i> Julie Dore Ben Miskell Jack Scott
3	<i>Birley Ward</i> Denise Fox Bryan Lodge Karen McGowan	12	<i>Firth Park Ward</i> Abtisam Mohamed	21	<i>Richmond Ward</i> Mike Drabble Dianne Hurst Peter Rippon
4	<i>Broomhill &amp; Sharrow Vale Ward</i> Michelle Cook Kieran Harpham Magid Magid	13	<i>Fulwood Ward</i> Sue Alston Andrew Sangar Cliff Woodcraft	22	<i>Shiregreen &amp; Brightside Ward</i> Dawn Dale Peter Price Garry Weatherall
5	<i>Burngreave Ward</i> Jackie Drayton Talib Hussain Mark Jones	14	<i>Gleadless Valley Ward</i> Lewis Dagnall Cate McDonald Chris Peace	23	<i>Southey Ward</i> Mike Chaplin Tony Damms Jayne Dunn
6	<i>City Ward</i> Douglas Johnson Robert Murphy Moya O'Rourke	15	<i>Graves Park Ward</i> Ian Auckland Sue Auckland Steve Ayriss	24	<i>Stannington Ward</i> David Baker Penny Baker
7	<i>Crookes &amp; Crosspool Ward</i> Anne Murphy	16	<i>Hillsborough Ward</i> Bob Johnson George Lindars-Hammond Josie Paszek	25	<i>Stocksbridge &amp; Upper Don Ward</i> Jack Clarkson Richard Crowther Keith Davis
8	<i>Darnall Ward</i> Mazher Iqbal Mary Lea Zahira Naz	17	<i>Manor Castle Ward</i> Lisa Banes Terry Fox Pat Midgley	26	<i>Walkley Ward</i> Olivia Blake Neale Gibson
9	<i>Dore &amp; Totley Ward</i> Joe Otten Colin Ross Martin Smith	18	<i>Mosborough Ward</i> David Barker Tony Downing Gail Smith	27	<i>West Ecclesfield Ward</i> John Booker Adam Hurst
				28	<i>Woodhouse Ward</i> Mick Rooney Jackie Satur Paul Wood



**1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

- 1.1 Apologies for absence were received from Councillors Andy Bainbridge, Ben Curran, Craig Gamble Pugh, Adam Hanrahan, Abdul Khayum, Alan Law, Vickie Priestley and Zoe Sykes.

**2. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

- 2.1 There were no declarations of interest made by Members of the Council.

**3. PUBLIC QUESTIONS AND PETITIONS AND OTHER COMMUNICATIONS**

3.1 Petitions

3.1.1 Petition Requesting Pedestrian Crossings Outside Sheffield Schools

The Council received an electronic petition containing 20 signatures, requesting the Council to install pedestrian crossings outside Sheffield schools.

There was no speaker to the petition.

The Council referred the petition to Councillor Jack Scott, Cabinet Member for Transport and Sustainability.

3.2 Public Questions

3.2.1 Public Question Concerning Section 106 Funds for High Green Parks

David Ogle stated that £16,000 of Section 106 funds had been allocated to High Green Parks in 2016. He asked where the funding was now, why it had been held on to for two years, why there had been no consultation with the High Green community, and why had local Councillors for the Ward ignored requests for information.

Councillor Mary Lea, Cabinet Member for Culture, Parks and Leisure, said in response that if Section 106 funds had been allocated and not used they would still be available for a suitable project. Councillor Lea confirmed that when a project idea was found officers would consult with the community and the money would be used. She advised that, with relatively small sums of Section 106 monies, match funding was sought or it was used on an existing project, and undertook to find out the details and contact the questioner.

3.2.2 Public Question Concerning Boilers at Angram Bank Pavilion

J. Brownrigg, Ecclesfield Parish Councillor, stated that one of two gas boilers at Angram Bank Pavilion at High Green had been condemned and

asked who would enforce the Council as Landlords on this matter.

Councillor Mary Lea, Cabinet Member for Culture, Parks and Leisure, said in response that she was not aware of the details for these boilers but advised that if the boiler was being replaced it would be included in a wider scheme of works. The Cabinet Member undertook to find out the details for this Pavilion and contact the Parish Councillor.

### 3.2.3 Public Question Concerning Awareness of Sickle Cell Anaemia

Gerald Edwards outlined the severity of symptoms of sickle cell anaemia and some of the difficulties experienced by those with the disease, and asked whether it would be beneficial to raise awareness within schools, with parents, and with the general public alike.

Councillor Cate McDonald, Cabinet Member for Health and Social Care, agreed it was a major issue and advised that it was included in the longstanding Public Health programme. The Cabinet Member undertook to get an update as to what was being done and contact the questioner.

Councillor Jackie Drayton, Cabinet Member for Children, Young People & Families, responded that Personal, Social, Health and Economic (PSHE) education was being included in schools' curriculums which would undoubtedly cover issues relating to diseases such as sickle cell anaemia. The Cabinet Member advised that she would speak with the Director of Public Health to see if more could be done in schools and would contact the questioner if further support was needed.

### 3.2.4 Public Question Concerning Automaton and Digitalisation in the Workplace and its Impact on Public Health

Nigel Slack, with reference to job loss from automaton and digitalisation in the workplace and its impact on public health, asked if the Council would look at developing a joined up policy across all the relevant communities and institutions.

Councillor Cate McDonald, Cabinet Member for Health and Social Care, said in response that the estimated rise in automated services and its subsequent impact on the population was debateable, with evidence not supporting the theorised rise in automated services. She agreed that it was something to be monitored, but was not at a critical point.

### 3.2.5 Public Question Concerning the Streets Ahead Contract

Nigel Slack asked when and where the Council will publish the full list of Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) for the Streets Ahead contract and details of the contractor's performance against those KPIs.

Councillor Bryan Lodge, Cabinet Member for Environment and Streetscene, responded that the contract was measured in milestones rather than KPIs

and information was published every month on the Council's website. Councillor Lodge advised that the core investment period had ended at the end of December 2017, a milestone which was currently being independently assessed, although there would be further investment during the 25-year lifecycle period.

### 3.2.6 Public Question Concerning the Council's Performance

Russell Johnson asked how close the Council was to renegotiating the contract with Amey considering their disastrous performance, and asked Julie Dore to review her position and resign as Leader of the Council in light of the catalogue of failures in recent years.

Councillor Julie Dore, Leader of the Council, replied that the only failures in this City were due to austerity measures imposed by the last coalition Government and continued by this Government.

### 3.2.7 Public Questions Concerning Trees and the Streets Ahead Contract

Sheldon Hall asked whether Labour amended the Streets Ahead contract to allow Amey to cut down trees over 70 years old and, if so, what was the purpose behind this amendment and what were the implications for the remaining twenty years of the contract.

J. Buxton asked whether Sheffield City Council had or has a contract with Amey LG Ltd and what was the payment of £600,000 for when no contract with Amey LG Ltd is available or visible to the public.

Secondly, Mr Buxton asked why Schedules 2 and 3 of the Streets Ahead contract (Output Specification and Method Statement) were redacted in full.

J. Buxton asked why numerous streets and pavements without trees still required resurfacing and whether extra resurfacing crews or extra felling crews would be taken on.

J. Buxton also asked whether the Leader of the Council, Julie Dore, had complete confidence in John Mothersole as the sponsor of the Streets Ahead contract and in his oversight of Council officers.

Councillor Bryan Lodge, Cabinet Member for Environment and Streetscene, responded to the questions. He stated that Labour had not amended the Streets Ahead contract. He confirmed that no Councillors had been involved in the drafting of the contract, which was instead done by professional officers.

Councillor Lodge confirmed he did not have the details to hand regarding the payment of £600,000 but undertook to contact the questioner outside the meeting with a response. He confirmed this response would be copied to all Council Members.

With regards to the redacted passages in the Streets Ahead contract, Councillor Lodge advised that part of the document included commercially sensitive information and had therefore been redacted. He stated that officers were currently going through the document in full and releasing as much information as possible but that this was a long process owing to the complexity of the contract.

Councillor Lodge advised that only a set percentage of roads were intended to be resurfaced in the first five years, with the rest of the road network being resurfaced on a rolling cycle based on condition surveys carried out zonally. If additional crews were needed to bring all roads up to an acceptable standard, this was a matter for Amey and would be at their cost.

In response to the final question, Councillor Julie Dore, Leader of the Council, replied that she had complete confidence in John Mothersole.

### 3.2.8 Public Questions Concerning Trees

Mr Dilner stated that Sheffield City Council stated in their Five Year Tree Management Strategy 2012-2017 that their strategic goals included the aims to “Improve public relationship with highway trees through positive engagement and good management” and “Improve understanding of benefits of urban trees through communications and events”, and asked whether the Council felt they had succeeded.

Secondly, Mr Dilner stated that a Forestry Commission report advised that 40-60 saplings equalled the ecosystem benefits of one mature tree, and asked why the Council had undertaken a one-for-one replacement.

Councillor Bryan Lodge, Cabinet Member for Environment and Streetscene, responded to both questions. He advised that tree management had not all gone smoothly, with a small number of people across the City remaining unhappy.

Councillor Lodge confirmed that the work undertaken had been assessed and deemed as necessary for reasons including inclusive mobility, and that engineering solutions had been completed throughout the City. He advised that concerns had been raised by residents over protestors preventing work from taking place, and highlighted that the majority of people wanted the work to continue.

## **4. MEMBERS' QUESTIONS**

### 4.1 Urgent Business

4.1.1 There were no questions relating to urgent business under the provisions of Council Procedure Rule 16.6(ii).

### 4.2 South Yorkshire Joint Authorities

- 4.2.1 There were no questions relating to the discharge of the functions of the South Yorkshire Joint Authorities for Fire and Rescue or Pensions, under the provisions of Council Procedure Rule 16.6(i).

## **5. MINUTES OF PREVIOUS COUNCIL MEETING**

- 5.1 RESOLVED: On the Motion of Councillor Peter Rippon, seconded by Councillor Michelle Cook, that the minutes of the meeting of the Council held on 6th December 2017 be approved as a true and accurate record.

## **6. REPRESENTATION, DELEGATED AUTHORITY AND RELATED ISSUES**

- 6.1 RESOLVED: On the Motion of Councillor Peter Rippon, seconded by Councillor Michelle Cook, that (a) Councillor Adam Hurst be appointed to serve on the Children, Young People and Family Support Scrutiny and Policy Development Committee in place of Councillor Josie Paszek and (b) Councillor Ian Saunders be appointed to serve on the Sheffield Conservation Advisory Group, filling a vacancy.

## **7. ADDING LIFE TO YEARS AND YEARS TO LIFE: DIRECTOR OF PUBLIC HEALTH REPORT FOR SHEFFIELD (2017)**

(Note: At this point in the proceedings, the Lord Mayor (Councillor Anne Murphy) left the meeting and the Deputy Lord Mayor (Councillor Magid Magid) took the chair for the remainder of the proceedings.)

- 7.1 The Council received a presentation by the Director of Public Health, Mr Greg Fell, concerning the health of the local population, which set out the three key strategic messages from the Joint Strategic Needs Assessment (JSNA) and why these were priorities for the City's health and wellbeing.
- 7.2 In his presentation, Greg Fell outlined how and why adverse childhood experiences, mental health (across the life course) and multi-morbidity were important in terms of their impact on healthy life expectancy, life expectancy, health inequalities and the use of health and social care services in Sheffield.
- 7.3 He described a number of priority actions identified in the report which were concerned with how best to respond to these issues and achieve required improvements. These actions took into account the available evidence, what was already happening in Sheffield, and the opportunities for maximising health and wellbeing outcomes accordingly.
- 7.4 Mr Fell outlined three key recommendations, made in the Annual Report, as follows:-
1. The Council and the Clinical Commissioning Group (CCG) should request Public Health England to co-ordinate further research into identifying and describing the long term return on investment and

effectiveness of models for preventing Adverse Childhood Experiences (ACEs).

2. The Council and the CCG should review the Sheffield mental health strategy and evaluate the city's approach to mental health and wellbeing against the current evidence base for high impact/high value interventions, including developing the economic case for investment in good mental health.
3. The Council and the CCG should commission more in-depth epidemiological analysis of changes in multi morbidity and ways to enhance Sheffield's approach to healthy ageing, including care of people who have multiple illnesses.

7.5 Members of the Council asked questions and commented upon issues raised by the Director of Public Health's Annual Report and presentation and these, together with the responses to them, are summarised below:

This report focussed on shifting the approach to health care, looking at prevention as well as treatment. Mr Fell acknowledged the key challenge was moving from a health and care system focused on an episode-based, reactive model, to a preventive and community focused model with a greater focus on utilising assets in the community (e.g. pharmacies) to enable people to self-manage and reduce acute illnesses.

Despite having a significant impact on health, no specific mention of air quality had been made in the report as it was being addressed in the new Clean Air Strategy, which had been taken to Cabinet for approval in December 2017.

A question was asked about the health implications of an application recently discussed by the Planning and Highways Committee. The Director of Public Health responded that he and the Chief Planning Officer had agreed to screen future planning applications for potential health impacts and advise where further stipulations were needed.

With regard to national public awareness campaigns, the evidence of success was mixed. With specific reference to smoking, campaigns 30 years ago had been very successful with lasting impacts on people's habits. This was now being extended into encouraging smokers to replace cigarettes with e-cigarettes as current evidence indicated that these were significantly less harmful than traditional cigarettes.

In response to further questions regarding vaping, the Director advised that there was no conclusive evidence that vaping encouraged children to smoke. He also stated that although less harmful than cigarettes, he would still not recommend vaping indoors owing to the distress reported by some people.

In response to a comment about promoting the health of employees in the



private sector, Mr Fell reported that it had been easier for larger companies to implement changes or policies but smaller businesses struggled owing to their smaller workforce. This was an issue recognised locally and nationally, with the Chamber of Commerce and other bodies recognising this.

With regard to the financial benefits to a healthy population and the economic benefits of a healthy workforce, the links between a healthy population and economic prosperity were increasingly being recognised. Mr Fell stated that there was a need to move away from short term savings and solutions based on a one-year financial cycle, and instead to look further into the future for a long term return on investment.

A question was asked as to whether more could be done by individuals, and the Director confirmed that the personal actions of the whole population of the City, rather than the provision of additional health services, would have far greater impact than changes to health services. Members discussed personal responsibility and the value of sport and exercise and noted that the advice to 'move more', regardless of starting point or ability, was recommended.

Responding to a comment regarding health inequalities and deprivation by Ward, the Director confirmed he was very concerned about the different outcomes. With regards to austerity, he confirmed the evidence was increasingly clear that austerity had a negative impact on health and wellbeing and was one of the factors in the slowing in the slowing of improvement in life expectancy, although it might not be the sole cause.

Responding to a comment about other illnesses, the Director advised that asthma was linked to damp in housing, poor air quality, and smoking. Support for people with diabetes could be improved; a Diabetes Prevention Programme was in place for individuals, which was effective but required willpower to stick to. A structural policy would have a much bigger impact, as demonstrated by the results seen by Sheffield International Venues who had implemented a sugar tax for over a year with positive results.

Responding to a number of points, Mr Fell advised that it was necessary to develop a clear model of how to help those affected by Adverse Childhood Experiences and to prevent them, which was why the report recommended further research and development in this area.

A question was asked as to the average waiting times for therapeutic services (mentioned at page 15 of the report) and how they had changed over the past 2 years, to which the Director of Public Health undertook to confirm the figures and contact the Member outside of the meeting. He also undertook to speak to interested Councillors about specific policies the Council could implement.

A comment was made about Members' experiences as local Councillors regarding the difficulty in accessing mental health services. Mr Fell acknowledged that Councillors would see the most complex cases and

agreed that although services in Sheffield were good, they could be improved.

With regard to 'gatekeeping' observed in relation to mental health treatment, the Director stated that enabling primary care services to refer patients with social, emotional or practical needs to local, non-clinical services, could help tackle the stigma of mental health problems and these issues of 'gatekeeping'.

- 7.6 RESOLVED: That this Council notes the information contained in the Director of Public Health's report, expresses support for the three recommendations outlined in the report for improving the health of the local population, and thanks him for his presentation.